

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: DA VINCI SURGICAL ROBOT) LEAD LEAD CASE
ANTITRUST LITIGATION,) NO.:
3:21-cv-03825-VC

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:
ALL CASES.

SURGICAL INSTRUMENT SERVICE) CASE NO.
COMPANY, INC,) 3:21-cv-03496-VC

Plaintiff,

v.

INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.,

Defendant.

DEPOSITION OF ROBERT HOWE
VOLUME I
REMOTELY IN BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS
FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 24, 2023

REPORTED BY: NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, CSR, RPR, RSR
CSR NO. 14125

JOB NO.: 5754439

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE: DA VINCI SURGICAL ROBOT) LEAD CASE NO.:
ANTITRUST LITIGATION,)
) 3:21-CV-03825-VC
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:)
ALL CASES.)
_____)

DEPOSITION OF ROBERT HOWE, VOLUME I
TAKEN ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF
REMOTELY VIA ZOOM VIDEOCONFERENCING, IN
BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS, BEGINNING AT
9:24 A.M. AND ENDING AT 4:03 P.M., ON
FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 24, 2023, BEFORE
NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, CERTIFIED SHORTHAND
REPORTER NUMBER 14125.

A P P E A R A N C E S

FOR THE PLAINTIFF, SURGICAL INSTRUMENT SERVICE
COMPANY, INC:

HALEY GUILIANO, LLP
BY: JOSH VAN HOVEN, ESQ.
111 NORTH MARKET STREET
SUITE 900
SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA 95113
(669) 213-1061
JOSHUA.VANHOVEN@HGLAW.COM

- AND -

SPECTOR ROSEMAN & KODROFF, P.C.
BY: JEFFREY R. CORRIGAN, ESQ.
TWO COMMERCE SQUARE
2001 MARKET STREET
SUITE 3420
PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA 19103
(215) 496-0300
JCORRIGAN@SRKATTORNEYS.COM.

FOR THE PROPOSED CLASS, HOSPITAL PLAINTIFFS:

BONI, ZACK & SNYDER, LLC
BY: JOSHUA SNYDER, ESQ.
BY: JOHN SINDONI, ESQ.
15 ST. ASAPHS ROAD
BALA CYNWYD, PENNSYLVANIA 19004
(610) 822-0200
JSNYDER@BONIZACK.COM
JSINDONI@BONIZACK.COM

FOR THE DEFENDANTS, INTUITIVE SURGICAL, INC.:

COVINGTON & BURLING, LLP
BY: ISAAC CHAPUT, ESQ.
415 MISSION STREET
FLOOR 54
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105
(415) 591-6000
ICHAPUT@COV.COM

A P P E A R A N C E S

ALSO PRESENT:

FRANKIE MATUS, VIDEOGRAPHER;

KIM PARNELL, PLAINTIFF'S EXPERT

1 for many years. Certainly during my, you know,
2 university training and graduate school.

3 Q. What do you mean it's so fundamental --

4 A. I was -- sorry, it goes back further than
5 that. Every freshman physics class considers
6 pulleys, so that would be my first year of college
7 that I formally looked at forces and motions and
8 pulleys.

9 Q. And through your education and your work,
10 have you seen pulleys in a number of devices in
11 addition to EndoWrists?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What are some examples of those?

14 A. Well, I'll start with some of the
15 beautiful mechanical designs from Dr. Ken Salisbury,
16 who invented the EndoWrist. He's perhaps the best
17 designer of cable drive systems that I'm familiar
18 with. One great example is the PHANTOM haptic
19 interface. This revolutionized the force feedback
20 field for human-machine interfaces. It uses what
21 are called capstan drives and pulleys in order to
22 provide high gear ratios from small electric motors
23 with essentially no friction and backlash. I can go
24 on, if you like, and offer more examples.

25 Q. Would it be fair to say that you have

1 probably seen hundreds of devices that have pulleys
2 of some sort?

3 MR. CHAPUT: Object to the form.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And I believe you talked about a -- I
6 don't know if it's Mr. or Dr. Salisbury designing a
7 pulley system.

8 Is that true?

9 A. I do.

10 Q. What is your understanding of when your
11 design was initially done?

12 A. In the 1990s.

13 Q. You also -- the -- said the Si EndoWrist
14 instruments have pins or dogs?

15 A. I did.

16 Q. What's your understanding of the function
17 of a pin or dog in an Si EndoWrist instrument?

18 A. So they're located some distance from the
19 center of rotation of the disk and pulley, and they
20 interlock with a mating hole on the drive side of
21 the robot, and they enable the application of forces
22 from the motor drive to the disk, and thus generate
23 a torque around the axis of the pulley or disk.

24 Q. And when you talk about application of
25 forces from the motor drive to the disk, that's via